

UC SANTA CRUZ

SELECT ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ON BEST PRACTICES FOR EQUITY AND DIVERSITY IN HIRING – RECRUITMENT

Compiled by the Advancing Faculty Diversity Workgroup, 2020-2021, UC Santa Cruz

Know the strategies that improve equity in hiring.

Bhalla, Needhi. 2019. Strategies to improve equity in faculty hiring. *Molecular Biology of the Cell*. 30(22).

<https://www.molbiolcell.org/doi/10.1091/mbc.E19-08-0476>

Abstract. Through targeted recruitment and interventions to support their success during training, the fraction of trainees (graduate students and postdoctoral fellows) in academic science from historically underrepresented groups has steadily increased. However, this trend has not translated to a concomitant increase in the number of faculty from these underrepresented groups. Here, I focus on proven strategies that departments and research institutions can develop to increase equity in faculty hiring and promotion to address the lack of racial and gender diversity among their faculty.

Commit to hiring criteria before posting the ad.

Uhlmann, Eric Luis and Geoffrey L. (2008). Cohen. Constructed Criteria: Redefining Merit to Justify Discrimination. *Psychological Science*. 16(6). 474-480.

<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.0956-7976.2005.01559.x>

Abstract. This article presents an account of job discrimination according to which people redefine merit in a manner congenial to the idiosyncratic credentials of individual applicants from desired groups. In three studies, participants assigned male and female applicants to gender-stereotypical jobs. However, they did not view male and female applicants as having different strengths and weaknesses. Instead, they redefined the criteria for success at the job as requiring the specific credentials that a candidate of the desired gender happened to have. Commitment to hiring criteria prior to disclosure of the applicant's gender eliminated discrimination, suggesting that bias in the construction of hiring criteria plays a causal role in discrimination.

Think carefully about how the desired research area is listed in the ad.

Stacy, Angelica, Goulden, Marc, Frasch, Karie and Broughton, Janet. 2018. Searching for a Diverse Faculty: Data-Driven Recommendations. Report from UC Berkeley.

http://www.ofew.berkeley.edu/sites/default/files/searching_for_a_diverse_faculty-_data-driven_recommendations.pdf

From the Executive Summary. The general practice that yielded the strongest positive association with diversity at various search stages was the practice of describing the search area in a way that was likely to tap especially rich applicant pools of women and URM. The results were especially striking when the search description explicitly mentioned research interests that included women or minorities.

Attending workshops improves uptake of recommendations by also affirming the value of social science categories and research.

Denise Sekaquaptewa, Koji Takahashi, Janet Malley, Keith Herzog, Sara Bliss. (2019) An evidence-based faculty recruitment workshop influences departmental hiring practice perceptions among university faculty. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal*. 38(7). 3-24.

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/330855656_An_evidence-based_faculty_recruitment_workshop_influences_departmental_hiring_practice_perceptions_among_university_faculty

From article. Findings: Faculty had more favorable attitudes toward equitable search strategies if they had attended a workshop or if they were in a department where more of their colleagues had. Workshop attendance also increased intentions to act on two of three recommendations measured, and led to greater belief in evidence-based descriptions of gender biases... *Practical implications:* The present studies demonstrate that an evidence-based recruitment workshop can lead faculty to adopt more favorable attitudes toward strategies that promote gender diversity in hiring. *Originality/value:* These studies provide evidence of the role of belief in social science research evidence in explaining the effectiveness of a program designed to increase faculty diversity.

Ongoing recruitment activities are key.

Re. proactive recruitment:

Bilimoria, D. & Buch, K. K. (2010). The search is on: Engendering faculty diversity through more effective search and recruitment. *Change*, July/August, 27-32.

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00091383.2010.489022>

AFDW Summary. This is a very good primer for understanding DEI efforts, including specific recommendations for STEM departments. It evaluates the traditional faculty search process, which it critiques for being: passive, time-limited, non-inclusive, non-diverse, lacking expertise in hiring, and bias-prone. The authors urge universities to “move from passive to *proactive models* of recruitment and aggressively pursue talented and diverse applicants rather than waiting for them to apply. We must recognize that this will require a shift from time-limited searches to *on-going* recruitment activities” (30; emphasis in original). In order to pursue this on-going recruitment, faculty and administrators should attend professional conferences with the specific goal of growing underrepresented candidate pools; the Compact for Faculty Diversity (www.instituteonteachingandmentoring.org/Compact/index.html), for instance, hosts the largest gathering of minority doctoral candidates in the nation.

Re. encouraging underrepresented applicants:

Johnson, Michael L. (2019). A Beginner’s Guide to Minority Professor Hires. American Society for Microbiology. Dec. 11.

<https://www.asm.org/Articles/2019/December/A-Beginner-s-Guide-to-Minority-Professor-Hires>

AFDW Summary. Succinct, practical advice for ways to encourage a more diverse applicant pool. Suggestions from the text include advice to “[r]ecognize and evaluate the intangibles of prospective professors... [t]alk with and seek advice from minority professors at your institution and ask them what their background was, how they got recruited and what made them feel more welcome at one place over another.... [and] [i]dentify URM individuals and encourage them to apply for open positions at your university.”

More balanced applicant pools lead to more equitable outcomes.

Heilman, Madeline E. (1980). The impact of situational factors on personnel decisions concerning women: Varying the sex composition of the applicant pool. *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*. 26(3). 386-395.

<https://nyuscholars.nyu.edu/en/publications/the-impact-of-situational-factors-on-personnel-decisions-concerni>

Abstract. One hundred male and female MBA students evaluated a woman applicant for a managerial position when the proportion of women in the applicant pool was varied. Results indicated that personnel decisions of both males and females were significantly more unfavorable when women represented 25% or less of the total pool. Additional findings suggest that this effect was mediated by the degree to which sex stereotypes predominated in forming impressions of applicants. The results were interpreted as supportive of the thesis that situational factors can function to reduce the adverse effects of sex stereotypes in employment settings.

Learn to recognize the variety of ways candidates engage in diversity work.

Lee Baker, D., Schmaling, K., Carlisle Fountain, K., Blume, A. W., & Boose, R. (2016). Defining diversity: A mixed-method analysis of terminology in faculty applications. *The Social Science Journal* , 53 (1), 60-66.

<https://daneshyari.com/article/preview/139974.pdf>

Abstract. A desirable societal goal may not imply a common understanding of that goal. As organizations seek to foster inclusion through a focus on diversity, understanding the operational definition employed by stakeholders becomes important. This study focuses on how candidates applying for employment address their diversity-related qualifications when specifically asked to do so. A model-driven qualitative coding system is used to characterize the diversity-related terminology in the cover letters of 111 applicants to a post-doctoral faculty fellowship position at a research university open to all academic disciplines. Applicants describe their strengths related to developing diversity-related curriculum and scholarship, aiding the recruitment and retention of a broad range of students and faculty, and establishing community partnerships to advance diversity. The analysis of applicants' letters indicates that applicants refer to race, ethnicity, gender, and class dimensions of diversity most frequently, suggesting that operational definitions tend to be more limited to traditionally and legally established taxonomies of human difference.

Know the legal framework protecting applicants and bolstering equity efforts

Re. legal frameworks for hiring in California

University of California Office of the General Counsel. 2015. Guidelines for Addressing Race and Gender Equity in Academic Programs in Compliance with Proposition 209. July.

<https://www.ucop.edu/uc-legal/files/guidelines-equity.pdf>

From report. While Proposition 209 eliminated some of the tools that the University had previously employed to achieve diversity in its student body and its workforce, there are many steps that the University can take to maintain and enhance diversity and equal opportunity. [The guidance in this report] is intended as a resource for University administrators considering measures that the University can legally implement to support the University's commitment to diversity.

Re. ensuring a non-ableist hiring process for candidates with disabilities

Dolmage, Jay and Kerschbaum, Stephanie. (2016). "Advice for hiring faculty members with disabilities." *Inside Higher Ed*. October 31.

<https://www.insidehighered.com/advice/2016/10/31/advice-hiring-faculty-members-disabilities-essay>

AFDW Summary. This article is packed with advice for how to create a non-discriminatory hiring process and, further, to encourage applicants with disabilities. Suggestions from the text include: “[Hiring units] should discuss how to preclude any disability discrimination in determining finalists for positions.... consider how different interview processes might disadvantage certain candidates... educate [themselves] on how disability disclosure may be (illegally) compelled in conversation... and [b]e aware of common forms of disability microaggressions.” AFDW further suggests that all search committees consult with whomever will be handling accommodations before a campus visit (note: this is often not the same office as that which handles student disability accommodations); further, if your campus has a faculty disability accommodation staff person or a disabled faculty organization (now running on many UC campuses), consider consulting them about best practices as well.

Re. moving beyond extant legal standards and their administrative interpretation

Kerschbaum, Stephanie L. et al. 2013. “Faculty Members, Accommodation, and Access in Higher Education.” *MLA Profession*. December.

<https://profession.mla.org/faculty-members-accommodation-and-access-in-higher-education/>

AFDW Summary. Written by several eminent disability studies scholars, these responses to the 2012 American Association of University Professors’ Bulletin “Accommodating Faculty Members Who Have Disabilities” offer important critiques of some emergent practices around hiring that while purporting to protect those with disabilities, in fact shore up legal discrimination against disabled candidates. For example, the codification of a set of “essential functions of the job” often fails to take into account the ways in which the body can change over time or ignores the existence of adaptive technologies that may assist a scholar in ways unanticipated by able-bodied administrators constructing such lists.

Cluster-hires can be an excellent strategy but be mindful of possible pitfalls at the early-career level.

Muñoz, S. M., Basile, V., Gonzalez, J., Birmingham, D., Aragon, A., Jennings, L., & Gloeckner, G. (2017). (Counter) narratives and Complexities: Critical Perspectives From a University Cluster Hire Focused on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion. *Journal of Critical Thought and Praxis*, 6(2), 1.

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/326967026_Counternarratives_and_Complexities_Critical_Perspectives_From_a_University_Cluster_Hire_Focused_on_Diversity_Equity_and_Inclusion

Abstract. Topics of diversity, equity, and inclusion continue to be accepted yet highly debated issues on college campuses. Seemingly, hiring of diverse faculty is a priority that many college campuses attempt without much regard to the organizational mechanisms which provide faculty of color support for success. One School of Education in a western land grant institution embarked on

a cluster hiring process that centered diversity, equity, and inclusion as part of their position priorities. Using critical race theory, this paper provides (counter)narratives to unearth and understand the complexities of hiring diverse faculty in a cluster hire process. Discussion and recommendations are provided for future practice.

Building diversity requires intentional focus and committed resources.

Wingfield, Adia Harvey. (2020). We Built a Diverse Academic Department in 5 Years. Here's How. *Harvard Business Review*. July 1.

https://hbr.org/2020/07/we-built-a-diverse-academic-department-in-5-years-heres-how?utm_campaign=hbr&utm_medium=social&utm_source=twitter

Summary. Washington University in St. Louis has one of the more racially diverse sociology departments in academia today. This is no accident. It was the result of intentional, consistent efforts from multiple stakeholders to create a department that would be both racially diverse and committed to excellence. If organizations that want to become truly diverse, they can learn from the three key elements of Wash U's success: firm, explicit support and resources from leadership; an intentional focus on racial diversity in hiring and advancement; and creating a culture that recognizes and responds to the realities Black workers face.

Institutional whiteness is created and maintained through biases both implicit and explicit.

Tate, Shirley Anne and Page, Damien. 2018. Whiteness and institutional racism: hiding behind (un)conscious bias. *Ethics and Education*. 13(1): 141-155.

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/17449642.2018.1428718?src=recsys>

Abstract. Unconscious bias happens by our brains making incredibly quick judgements and assessments without us realising. Biases are influenced by background, cultural environment and experiences and we may not be aware of these views and opinions, or of their full impact and implications. This article opposes this point of view by arguing that bias is not unconscious but is (un)conscious and linked to Charles Mills' 'Racial Contract' and its 'epistemologies of ignorance'. These epistemologies emerge from what the Equality Challenge Unit (ECU) calls 'our background, cultural environment and personal experience'. Asserting that racism stems from 'unconscious bias' diminishes white supremacy and maintains white innocence as a 'will to forget' institutional racism. In equality and diversity training 'unconscious bias' has become a performative act to move beyond racism through training to participate in a constructed 'post-racial' reality. The article

argues that through decolonizing 'unconscious bias', 'white fragility' and 'self-forgiveness' we can begin to see hidden institutional whiteness at the base of (un)conscious bias.